



Democratic Support

Plymouth City Council
Civic Centre
Plymouth PL1 2AA

Please ask for Helen Rickman
T 01752 398444
E helen.rickman@plymouth.gov.uk
www.plymouth.gov.uk/democracy
Published 07 November 2013

WORKING PLYMOUTH

PARK AND RIDE BUS SERVICE REVIEW

Monday 18 November 2013
3.00 pm
Council House, Plymouth (Next to the Civic Centre)

Members:

Councillor Murphy, Chair
Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Darcy and Wheeler.

Members are invited to attend the above meeting to consider the items of business overleaf.

This is the third of four review meetings for the Park and Ride Bus Service Review.

Tracey Lee
Chief Executive

WORKING PLYMOUTH

AGENDA

PART I – PUBLIC MEETING

1. APOLOGIES

To receive apologies for non-attendance by panel members.

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Members will be asked to make any declarations of interest in respect of items on this agenda.

3. MINUTES (Pages 1 - 4)

To confirm the minutes of the meeting held on 28 October 2013.

4. CHAIR'S URGENT BUSINESS

To receive reports on business which, in the opinion of the Chair, should be brought forward for urgent consideration.

5. PARK AND RIDE BUS SERVICE - FURTHER ANALYSIS OF RESULTS. (Pages 5 - 8)

The panel will be provided with a further analysis of some of the results from the Park and Ride Bus Service survey as requested at the last meeting under minute 35 (1).

6. COMPARATIVE DATA FOR PARK AND RIDE BUS SERVICES AND CONCESSIONARY TRAVEL PASSES (Pages 9 - 10)

The panel will be provided comparative data for other Park and Ride Bus Services as well as information on Concessionary Travel Passes.

7. WITNESSES

The panel will have the opportunity to discuss the Park and Ride Bus Service with representatives from First Group PLC, Target Travel, the Life Centre, Derriford Hospital, TravelWatch SouthWest, and the Council's Head of Integrated Transport.

Representatives have been invited to attend for the following times however these are only approximate:

3.45 Life Centre

4.00 Derriford Hospital

4.15 TravelWatch SouthWest

4.30 Target Travel

4.45 First Group PLC

8. EXEMPT BUSINESS

To consider passing a resolution under Section 100A (4) of the Local Government Act 1972 to exclude the press and public from the meeting for the following item(s) of business on the grounds that it (they) involve(s) the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph(s) of Part I of Schedule 12A of the Act, as amended by the Freedom of Information Act 2000.

PART II (PRIVATE MEETING)

AGENDA

MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC TO NOTE

that under the law, the Panel is entitled to consider certain items in private. Members of the public will be asked to leave the meeting when such items are discussed.

NIL.

This page is intentionally left blank

Working Plymouth

Monday 28 October 2013

PRESENT:

Councillor Murphy, in the Chair.
Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Darcy and Wheeler.

Also in attendance: Ralph Ellis (Public Transport Officer), Debbie Newcombe (Public Transport Officer), Gill Peele (Lead Officer), (Helen Rickman (Democratic Support Officer) and Andy Sharp (Public Transport Manager).

The meeting started at 3.30 pm and finished at 5.00 pm.

Note: At a future meeting, the committee will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

32. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no declarations of interest in accordance with the code of conduct.

33. **MINUTES**

Agreed that the minutes of 30 September 2013 were an accurate record of the meeting.

34. **CHAIR'S URGENT BUSINESS**

There were no items of Chair's Urgent Business.

35. **RESULTS OF THE PARK AND RIDE SURVEY**

Members discussed the results of the Park and Ride survey that took place on Tuesday 8 October 2013 at all three Park and Ride sites.

The following comments were raised by Members:

- (a) the 'comments' section at the end of the survey needed to be condensed as there was a lot of repetition;
- (b) the 'users of Park and Ride from postcodes outside of Plymouth' section of the survey specified 33% of users were from 'other' locations than those specified however Members considered it would have been beneficial if those locations had been identified; Members agreed that the results of the survey, with regards to users outside of Plymouth, should be specified into percentages from Cornwall, Devon and Somerset;

- (c) the results of the survey highlighted that it was mostly women that used the Park and Ride Bus Service;
- (d) in some instances the survey highlighted that some passengers did not use the Park and Ride service closest to them; it was considered that this could be because of a variety of reasons such as work or childcare arrangements;
- (e) part of the survey asked passengers to identify how they travelled to the Park and Ride site and, if by car, how many passengers were car sharing; Members noted that this information was not contained within the analysis of results however officers confirmed that the number was insubstantial as the majority of passengers drove to the car park alone;
- (f) the figures showed that a considerable amount of users of the Park and Ride Service had a concessionary pass and of those users 75% would still use the service if they were required to pay;
- (g) it was considered that the survey was a success as a significant number of passengers participated;
- (h) 90% of passengers rated the service good; Members welcomed the positive feedback;
- (i) a gentleman at the George Interchange Park and Ride site who was questioned as part of the survey was full of praise for the PR3 service; this extended to the service as a whole and members of staff;
- (j) it was considered that the PR3 was a popular service used by visitors to Derriford Hospital and students of the University of St Mark and St John; the service was considered to be cheaper than the cost of parking;

In response to questions raised it was reported by Officers that –

- (l) some of the questionnaire results were incomplete as several passengers had to stop answering questions in order to catch their bus;
- (m) on the day that Councillors and officers were undertaking the park and ride survey, First Group PLC introduced the offer for concessionary pass holders in which they were able to travel on the bus, before 9.30am, for a charge of £1;

Agreed that –

- (l) the results of the survey, with regards to ‘users outside of Plymouth’ section, should be specified into percentages from Cornwall, Devon and Somerset;

- (2) officers would research the possibility of applying the special amenity element of the Travel Concessions (Eligible Services) (Amendment 2009) to the Milehouse, Coypool and the George Interchange Park and Ride services;

36. **WITNESSES**

The Chair informed Members that Richard Stevens, Managing Director for CityBus, would be in attendance at the meeting in order to provide Members with details of his experience having run several Park and Ride Bus Services in the South West and how these Park and Ride services compared with Plymouth.

In response to Members questions Richard Stevens responded that –

- (a) he had previously run Park and Ride Bus Services in Truro, Exeter, Taunton and Bristol;
- (b) from his experience, the majority of Park and Ride Bus Services sold tickets on the bus;
- (c) certain Park and Ride Services had to pay departure charges but these could be changed;
- (d) Park and Ride Bus Services generally had limited stop offs and were direct services however Exeter Green Park and Ride was linked with a registered bus service so had more stop off points;
- (e) Taunton's Park and Ride Bus Service did not allow for concessionary users to use their pass on this service;
- (f) CityBus would be interested in running a Park and Ride Service in Plymouth however this was not yet a priority for the company and would depend on variety of factors including departure charges and passenger numbers;
- (g) it was considered that to allow concessionary users to use their pass on the Park and Ride Bus Service was discretionary;
- (h) it was considered that First Group PLC did a good job running Plymouth's Park and Ride Bus Service; he considered the fares to be perhaps too cheap but ultimately the main factors customers would judge the service on would be quality and frequency;
- (i) Coypool car park had limited car parking spaces and it was unlikely that patronage could be increased for this specific site due to capacity issues;
- (j) Oxford's Park and Ride Bus Service charged passengers to park as well as for

their bus ticket; it was considered that this wouldn't work in Plymouth as there were a lot of competitively priced car parks that could be used if extra charges were added;

- (k) if two operators ran the Park and Ride Bus Service there would be an uplift in perceived frequency and use however it was not known where the new interest for the service would come from;
- (l) it was considered that Coypool Park and Ride site would not work as an interchange as improved facilities would need to be provided.

Under this item members discussed arrangements for the next meeting and confirmed that representatives from TravelWatch SouthWest, First Group PLC (Devon and Cornwall) and Target Travel would be in attendance.

Agreed that –

- (1) invitations should be extended to representatives from the Life Centre and Derriford Hospital;
- (2) officers would provide the panel with more information regarding Cambridge's Park and Ride Bus Service and the effects introducing the charges had on passenger numbers and activity;
- (3) the Council's Head of Integrated Transport would be invited to the next meeting.

37. **EXEMPT BUSINESS**

There were no items of exempt business.

**Working Plymouth
Park and Ride Bus Service Review**

Analysis of additional comments/ feedback

Reliable and Convenient	48%
Frequency	18%
Quick	18%
Polite and friendly drivers	8%
Cheap	4%
Clean	3%
Accessibility	1%

Other comments:

- Plenty of parking
- First time traveller on P&R
- PR3 should run weekends
- Would like to run later
- Sometimes delays
- Shame about increasing prices
- Traffic delays the service
- Not enough double deckers
- Lovely
- Single decker from 5-11pm bus viaduct, no double decker peak time
- Good morning service
- Time of buses, always late, more buses at 5pm, should use Bretonside
- Depends on the driver - attitude/driving. Better discount for monthly basis Pay for what you use
- Toilets poor, not a great gateway, regular service
- Wait a long time for buses, PR1 stack up - time for waiting affect PR2 buses
- More than 10 mins, gap in evenings between buses
- No alternative - other buses changed times, would be late for work without it
- Size of bus isn't adequate for foot fall of passengers
- Easy to park, no traffic
- Have tried other services and this is the best
- Convenience but sometimes buses delayed trying to load too many passengers
- Very often at 6.20 no bus due to events
- Finish too early
- Convenience, always in time, drivers friendly. I have a disability so being able to park and board bus on the flat is excellent
- Better with ticket man, causes delays
- Would like to be able to use the concession pass earlier
- Could run later into the evening
- Some drivers are rude
- Sometimes after 8am so busy waiting about and standing is not nice.
- Except long wait at Milehouse on inbound from George

This page is intentionally left blank

**Working Plymouth Scrutiny Panel
Park and Ride Survey**

Non Plymouth Post codes

PL12 6PA	Saltash
PL15	?
PX21 5BP	?
3437	AUSTRALIA
PL20	Bere Ferrers
EX39 2RX	Bideford
EX39 3SA	Bideford
PL31 2FG	Bodmin
PL35 0EW	Boscastle
EX23 8LU	Bude
PL17 7QQ	Callington
No Postcode	Callington
PL17 8BJ	Callington
PL17 8DF	Callington
EX15 2AD	Collumpton
EX17 3PF	Crediton
EX22 6HX	Exeter
EX8	Exeter
EX2 7PZ	Exeter
EX2 4AI	Exeter
EX8 1DY	Exeter
EX6 7NA	Exeter
EX5 7BF	Exeter
EX1 3TR	Exeter
EX2 5BS	Exeter
EX31 3UX	Exeter
TR11 5QB	Falmouth
No Postcode	Falmouth
PL18 9BU	Gunnislake
PL19 8BQ	Gunnislake
PL18 9AZ	Gunnislake
EX14 9JX	Honiton
No Postcode	ISLE OF MAN
PL21 9JG	Ivybridge
PL21 9TT	Ivybridge
PL21 9BU	Ivybridge
PL21 0JZ	Ivybridge
PL21 9RW	Ivybridge
PL21 9UJ	Ivybridge
PL21 9PP	Ivybridge
PL21 9EX	Ivybridge
PL21 0HX	Ivybridge
PL21 9XB	Ivybridge
PL21 9TL	Ivybridge
PL21 9TH	Ivybridge
PL21 9PP	Ivybridge
PL21 0JP	Ivybridge
PL21 9PP	Ivybridge
PL21 9TX	Ivybridge
PL21 0DX	Ivybridge

**Working Plymouth Scrutiny Panel
Park and Ride Survey**

Non Plymouth Post codes

PL21 9BZ	Ivybridge
PL21 9BP	Ivybridge
PL21 9BP	Ivybridge
PL21 6BX	Ivybridge
TQ7 3AE	Kingsbridge
PL14 3NJ	Liskeard
PL14 3NJ	Liskeard
TA24 6QW	MINEHEAD
TR7 2JR	Newquay
TQ12 6JY	Newton Abbott
TQ12 2JH	Newton Abbott
TQ13 7QW	Newton Abbott
TQ12 4LF	Newton Abbott
TQ12 4JW	Newton Abbott
TQ13 9QN	Newton Abbott
TQ13 0PH	Newton Abbott
TQ12 1SA	Newton Abbott
TQ13 9QT	Newton Abbott
TQ13 0QE	Newton Abbott
TQ13 0DQ	Newton Abbott
No Postcode	Newton Abbott
PL8 2HL	Newton Ferris
PL8 1AW	Newton Ferris
EX20 1DS	Oakhampton
TQ3 3YE	Paignton
TQ4 7NQ	Paignton
TQ3 2RQ	Paignton
TQ4 5HG	Paignton
TR15 1AN	Redruth
TR16 6AW	Redruth
TR16 6NW	Redruth
SP2 8BG	Salisbury
PL12	Saltash
PL12 6PF	Saltash
PL12 4NJ	Saltash
EX10 9EZ	Sidmouth
TQ10 9DQ	South Brent
PL19	Tavistock
PL19 9AT	Tavistock
PL19 9DJ	Tavistock
PL19	Tavistock
PL19 9BS	Tavistock
PL19 9AH	Tavistock
PL19 9DD	Tavistock
PL19 8HS	Tavistock
PL19 9LS	Tavistock
No Postcode	Tavistock
No Postcode	Tavistock
No Postcode	Tavistock
No Postcode	Tavistock

**Working Plymouth Scrutiny Panel
Park and Ride Survey**

Non Plymouth Post codes

EX3 0EY	Topham
PL11 2LB	Torpoint
TQ2 6BF	Torquay
TQ9 5QX	Totnes
NP10 9LB	Wales
PL9 0HJ	Wembury
PL8 2EY	Yealmpton
PL20 7UF	Yelverton
PL20 6NQ	Yelverton
PL20 6JD	Yelverton
PL20	Yelverton
PL20 6NG	Yelverton
PL20 6NF	Yelverton
PL20 6NF	Yelverton
PL20 7PX	Yelverton
PL20 7LZ	Yelverton
PL20 7UZ	Yelverton
PL20 6BD	Yelverton
No Postcode	Yelverton
PL20 7BZ	Yelverton
PL20 7PG	Yelverton
PL20 7DF	Yelverton

SUMMARY

Ivybridge	17%
Yelverton	11%
Tavistock	11%
Newton Abbott	10%
Exeter	8%
Callington	3%
Paignton	3%
Saltash	2%
Gunnislake	3%
Liskeard	2%
Redruth	3%
Other Devon	17%
Other Cornwall	5%
Other	5%

This page is intentionally left blank

PLYMOUTH'S PARK & RIDE

Scrutiny Panel Report



1. Introduction

As part of the Scrutiny Panel investigation into the operation of the City's Park & Ride services, Officers were asked to produce a report on the options for the continued acceptance of Concessionary Travel passes on Plymouth's Park & Ride services and an examination of what other Local Authorities have done. Officers were also asked to report back with more detail on Cambridgeshire County Council's intention to introduce parking charges at their Park & Ride sites.

2. Background

The English National Concessionary Travel Scheme (ENCTS) follows primary legislation to permit free travel on all local bus services within England from 0930 to 2300 Monday to Friday and at any time over weekends and bank holidays for anyone of pensionable age or those who are disabled and meet set eligibility criteria. Each time a journey is made the Local Transport Authority responsible for the area the passenger boards reimburses the bus operator a set fee. As the Park and Ride services in Plymouth are registered as local bus services they have been included in the concessionary travel scheme since it started. However, in 2009 an amendment known as The Travel Concessions (Eligible Services) (Amendment) 2009 was introduced, which clarifies eligible services and gives Local Transport Authorities the option to make changes should they wish to. One of these clarifications is detailed below and explains that a service could be exempt if an amenity element is included within the fare. In the case of Park and Ride's the provision of car parking spaces can be considered an amenity.

Direct quote from The Travel Concessions (Eligible Services) (Amendment) 2009

"4.—(1) A service is not an eligible service under section 146 of the Transport Act 2000

if—...

(e) the fare for the service includes a special amenity element.

3. What has happened elsewhere

Whilst certain Park & Ride services have never accepted ENCTS passholders for free, such as Taunton, there are a small number which have amended entitlement since the Travel Concessions Amendment was introduced in 2009. Two examples are given below.

3.1 Norwich

Norfolk County Council removed free travel for ENCTS passholders in Norwich, following approval from their Cabinet in 2011, on the Norwich Park & Ride service. ENCTS passholders are now charged a £1 flat fee per single journey. The Council reported receiving approximately 30 complaints, and whilst patronage reduced by 2% following the change in entitlement revenue increased by approximately £100k per annum.

3.2 Chester

Cheshire West and Chester Council removed free travel for ENCTS passholders from April 2013. Again there were a number of complaints following the change. No data was available for whether passenger numbers and / or revenue increased or decreased. The service is tendered by the Local Authority.

4. Plymouth's Park & Ride

Following advice from the Department for Transport and a further consideration by Officers of the Travel Concessions Amendment the conclusion is that it appears, in principle, the amenity of car parking provision can be demonstrated for each of Plymouth's three Park & Ride services which would make it possible for the Council to remove ENCTS free travel entitlement from these services. The Council's Legal team have been asked to consider this possible change against the Travel Concessions Amendment.

Additional factors to consider are:

- In certain circumstances, such as Milehouse, Windsor House and the George Park & Ride site, there will be other services departing from the same stop as the Park & Ride which will accept ENCTS passes.
- As the Park & Ride services are operated commercially the Council could not insist that an alternative reduced fare is offered for ENCTS passholders and would instead need to discuss with the relevant bus operators.

5. Charging to park at Cambridge's Park & Ride sites.

This information is derived from a Cambridgeshire County Council Cabinet Report. Cambridge is planning to introduce a £1 car parking charge at its five Park & Ride sites in the city. It is not planned at this stage to introduce charges at the two new sites on the Cambridge Guided Busway.

Park & Ride bus services are provided commercially by Stagecoach (as in Plymouth) but site costs amount to £1 million per annum. Various income streams cover 25% of these costs leaving the Council to fund the shortfall. Consultants Atkins submitted estimates that a £1 car park charge would result in 5.4% fall in patronage but would however deliver approximately £1.5 million income generation per annum. A £1 charge at the Park & Ride site would still represent good value as car parking in the centre of Cambridge is limited and all –day parking costs between £12.50 and £25.00 per day.

Cambridgeshire County Council believes therefore that there will be a quick recovery from any reduction in patronage and they quoted the Oxford example where a £1.50 car park charge had little or no long term effect on patronage. It should be noted that Stagecoach has expressed publicly its strong objection to the introduction of parking charges.